#### Contention One is our artifact:

Stewart NDG

(Tim, full-time Washington Representative, “Coalbed Methane in the Powder River Basin,” <http://www.google.com/url?sa=t&rct=j&q=&esrc=s&source=web&cd=1&ved=0CCAQFjAA&url=http%3A%2F%2Fusers.wfu.edu%2Fpalmitar%2FCourses%2FEnergy%2520Law%2FStudent%2520Papers%2FPapers%2FStewart%2520-%2520CoalBed.doc&ei=YE1LUIvaKamCiwKnsoFY&usg=AFQjCNHef99On86qcg6Kog87pNHDws86-A&sig2=GawDTEb7Yh119AkGlM95vg//wyo-mm>)

As would be expected given the coal industry’s prodigious output, mining dominates the Wyoming economy. In 2005, mining accounted for over 30% of Wyoming’s GDP. The next largest sector, state and local government, contributed less than 10% to the state’s GDP. Mining interests wield extraordinary political power, and many of the residents are extremely proud of the industry. Even if they don’t depend on it for their livelihoods, the business generated by mining contributes greatly to the entire community’s standard of living. The energy sector has been successful at lobbying to create a School of Energy Resources at the University of Wyoming and regularly donates millions of dollars to a variety of university programs. Due to the fact that the mineral industry is so ingrained in the local culture, people who would challenge mining’s place in the Powder River Basin face an uphill battle and should be prepared to respond to the public’s fears about the economic impact of interruptions in the mining process. The state is not only energy-friendly but also staunchly conservative. On the flip side there are still many residents who make their living off the land, and in general people in the region have a healthy respect for conservation. Growing up in the midst of a wilderness teaches people to appreciate their natural resources. This duality is readily apparent: not only does Wyoming power the nation’s coal plants, it also plays home to one of the most spectacular nature preserves in the world—Yellowstone Park.

Michler 11

(Andrew, Inhabitat, “Chris Drury's "Carbon Sink" Art Installation Strikes Nerve of Wyoming Coal Industry,” July 27, 2011, http://inhabitat.com/chris-drurys-carbon-sink-art-installation-strikes-nerve-of-wyoming-coal-industry///wyo-mm)

#### “They get millions of dollars in royalties from oil, gas and coal to run the university, and then they put up a monument attacking me, demonizing the industry,” stated Marion Loomis, the director of the Wyoming Mining Association.

#### Lockwood 12

(Jeffrey, renowned entomologist and accomplished writer/philosopher who first arrived at the University of Wyoming in the 1980s to conduct groundbreaking research on grasshoppers, insecticides and biological controls, professor of philosophy and creative writing, WyoFile, “Behind the Carbon Curtain Art and Freedom in Wyoming,” 2012, <http://wyofile.com/2012/07/behind-the-carbon-curtain-art-and-freedom-in-wyoming///wyo-mm>)

OK, there was no book burning at the university, but there was something every bit as horrifying to those who value free speech. In May, the art installation Carbon Sink: What Goes Around Comes Around was destroyed and its remains consigned to the dump, “bone yard” and power plant (of course, the coal was burned).1 The only evidence of this compelling and controversial artwork that implied a connection between fossil fuels, climate change, and dying forests is a circular patch of sod. A central purpose of a university is to foster discussion of important issues. Drawing attention to the consequences of how modern society fuels itself (the artwork shined a light on the environmental costs of our individual and collective behaviors) seems perfectly aligned with the goal of promoting intelligent, civil discourse. So, why would the University of Wyoming destroy a powerful piece of art that had catalyzed such lively conversation about one of the vital issues of our time?

Scott 11

(Evelina, Provisions, “Wyoming’s “Carbon Sink” Draws Attention,” August 2, 2011, http://provisionslibrary.com/?p=12538//wyo-mm)

#### “While I would never tinker with the University of Wyoming budget—I’m a great supporter of the University of Wyoming—every now and then you have to use these opportunities to educate some of the folks at the University of Wyoming about where their paychecks come from,” - State representative Tom Lubnau.

#### Lockwood 12

(Jeffrey, renowned entomologist and accomplished writer/philosopher who first arrived at the University of Wyoming in the 1980s to conduct groundbreaking research on grasshoppers, insecticides and biological controls, professor of philosophy and creative writing, WyoFile, “Behind the Carbon Curtain Art and Freedom in Wyoming,” 2012, <http://wyofile.com/2012/07/behind-the-carbon-curtain-art-and-freedom-in-wyoming///wyo-mm>)

Given the extraordinary generosity of the legislature to UW, the institution is indebted to the politicians who are, in turn, beholden to the energy industry. Even though the piece was as much about individual responsibility as corporate accountability, legislators from energy-rich counties were unhappy with Carbon Sink.6 The declining demand for coal and the falling prices for natural gas made a fossil-fueled state government grumpy. Commonsense, experience with the Wyoming Way, and conversations with legislators7 leaves little doubt that the university administration traded free speech for political pacification (“extortion” is such an ugly word). People on the inside of Wyoming politics say that the day the artwork was destroyed, a servile email was sent to the carbonophilous legislators.8 Whether or not this bit of obsequious icing was added to the humble pie, our leaders should consider the warning of Somerset Maugham (a darling of conservatives,9 despite his being gay): “If a nation [or university?] values anything more than freedom, it will lose its freedom; and the irony of it is that if it is comfort or money that it values more, it will lose that, too.” Maybe I’m just paranoid. But like Kurt Cobain (not a favorite of conservatives) said, “Just because you’re paranoid doesn’t mean they aren’t after you.” And in this case, what might otherwise be a conspiracy theory became an explicit political policy during the 2012 legislative session.

#### The artist Chris Drury stated,

Robbins 11

(Jim, The New York Times, “Coal-Themed Sculpture Annoys Lawmakers,” July 21, 2011, http://green.blogs.nytimes.com/2011/07/21/coal-themed-sculpture-annoys-lawmakers///wyo-mm)

#### “I’m not trying to shove it down everyone’s throat, but I hope people will have a conversation” because of the sculpture, he said.

Lockwood continues,

(Jeffrey, renowned entomologist and accomplished writer/philosopher who first arrived at the University of Wyoming in the 1980s to conduct groundbreaking research on grasshoppers, insecticides and biological controls, professor of philosophy and creative writing, WyoFile, “Behind the Carbon Curtain Art and Freedom in Wyoming,” 2012, <http://wyofile.com/2012/07/behind-the-carbon-curtain-art-and-freedom-in-wyoming///wyo-mm>)

Not satisfied with the destruction of an artwork that conveyed an inconvenient truth, the Wyoming legislature wanted to assure that future artists wouldn’t offend the mineral magnates. So, in the appropriation for the renovation of the campus gym, the politicians mandated: “In providing artwork for the half acre recreation center pursuant to the provisions of W.S. 16-6-801 through 16-6-805, the university shall require artwork which displays the historical, cultural and current significance of transportation, agriculture and minerals in Wyoming’s history. Notwithstanding the provisions of W.S. 16-6-801 through 16-6-805 [which specifies that a panel representing the local community, art community, architect and state agency advise on the selection of art] the proposals for artwork shall be submitted to the university’s energy resources council and the governor for approval.”

Pelzer 11

(Jeremy, The Star tribune, “University of Wyoming sculpture blasts fossil fuels ,” July 13, 2011, http://trib.com/news/state-and-regional/article\_82943c8e-c869-5ffd-9874-8730df510368.html#ixzz1S1tgmtnJ//wyo-mm)

#### “I just wanted to make that connection between the burning of coal and the dying of trees,” Drury said. “But I also wanted to make a very beautiful object that pulls you in, as it were.”

#### Lockwood continues,

(Jeffrey, renowned entomologist and accomplished writer/philosopher who first arrived at the University of Wyoming in the 1980s to conduct groundbreaking research on grasshoppers, insecticides and biological controls, professor of philosophy and creative writing, WyoFile, “Behind the Carbon Curtain Art and Freedom in Wyoming,” 2012, <http://wyofile.com/2012/07/behind-the-carbon-curtain-art-and-freedom-in-wyoming///wyo-mm>)

Foxes Guarding the Henhouse? Not surprisingly, the School of Energy Resources Council includes some highly competent people when it comes to energy, such as vice-presidents from Marathon Oil and Arch Coal, along with the retired CEO for Basin Electric. As to whether these guys (they’re all men except for an ex officio member) represent a balanced portfolio, consider that this group comprises the Advanced Conversion Technologies Task Force — formerly known as the Clean Coal Task Force. Also not surprisingly, my best efforts to explore their backgrounds came up with no evidence that any of them possess the slightest expertise in the arts, which appears to put them on equal footing with Governor Mead. The sole qualification of our legislatively appointed censors is the capacity to choose art that will please — or at least not offend — some of Wyoming’s thin-skinned, fat-wallet enterprises (Perhaps tourism was omitted for fear that an environmental theme could creep in if this vital industry was included).

Pelzer 11

(Jeremy, The Star tribune, “University of Wyoming sculpture blasts fossil fuels ,” July 13, 2011, http://trib.com/news/state-and-regional/article\_82943c8e-c869-5ffd-9874-8730df510368.html#ixzz1S1tgmtnJ//wyo-mm)

#### Loomis said it’s “hard to tell” whether the sculpture would affect the mining industry’s donations to UW in the future. “I’ll have to see what it looks like, I guess,” he said. “And maybe they’ll put up a sculpture commending the affordable, reliable electricity that comes from coal on the other end of Prexy’s Pasture.”

#### Lockwood continues,

(Jeffrey, renowned entomologist and accomplished writer/philosopher who first arrived at the University of Wyoming in the 1980s to conduct groundbreaking research on grasshoppers, insecticides and biological controls, professor of philosophy and creative writing, WyoFile, “Behind the Carbon Curtain Art and Freedom in Wyoming,” 2012, <http://wyofile.com/2012/07/behind-the-carbon-curtain-art-and-freedom-in-wyoming///wyo-mm>)

But consider this analysis of “Stalin as Art Critic and Art Patron”: “Art under Stalin developed under unique conditions of total state control which made all forms and means of artistic expression served propagandistic purposes. The state proclaimed the arts to be its ideological weapon, established a monopoly over art production and distribution, and created a system of control over art with strict criteria of what kind of art society needs. All deviations from the state’s demands, either in form or in content, were strictly forbidden and the violators prosecuted.”11 Welcome to life behind the Carbon Curtain.

Scott 11

(Evelina, Provisions, “Wyoming’s “Carbon Sink” Draws Attention,” August 2, 2011, http://provisionslibrary.com/?p=12538//wyo-mm)

#### “I must also say, as I’m sure many already have, that it was absolutely delightful, energizing, and thrilling to discover that the arts have such subversive political potential that an installation can threaten the socioeconomic hegemony of the energy industry in Wyoming.” –Drury’s blog

#### Contention two is our criticism:

#### These stories demonstrate that we live under a governing body that deceptively gives us the illusion of freedom, while guiding us toward a specific mode of action and thought process that ostracizes difference and cedes power to the elites whose goal is to take energy to build profit.

Guillebeau 10

(Chris, The Art of Non-Conformity: Set Your Own Rules, Live the Life You Want, and Change the World, Chapter 4: “How to Fight Authority and Win,” subsection: Marginalization and the Department of No//wyo-mm)

Why do people do … Human Resources.8

#### This energy elitism however, isn’t unique to Wyoming. Tim DeChristopher of Utah in 2008 demonstrated the ever-present gatekeepers and power-figures of society who are dominating the frame of our decisions: even in light of asking for redirection, the government decided to make an example of DeChristopher to say this is what we can do, and this is what we will do…

#### Boyd and Mitchell 12

(Andrew and Dave, Boyd is an author and a twenty-five-year veteran of creative campaigns for social change. He led the decade-long satirical media campaign "Billionaires for Bush." He co-founded Agit-Pop Communications, an award-winning “subvertising” agency, Mitchell is a writer, editor and researcher. He edited the Canadian activist publication Briarpatch Magazine from 2005 to 2010, “Beautiful Trouble,” pg 290//wyo-mm)

In December 2008, … federal prison.

#### Failure to interrogate these power structures however turns us into “docile bodies”, in which endless wars and nuclear exchange are inevitable

Campbell, prof of cultural and political geography at Durham Univ. 1992

(David, *Writing Security*) NG

Foucault posited …World War II period.

#### Just as the energy production-centric logic makes speaking out against power structures from our stance as students at the University of Wyoming particularly dangerous, this year’s resolution is framed in the same way. Many debaters will be docile and increase incentives, but energy is a complex entity, and without an interrogation of our genealogical relationship with energy, our understandings will inevitably be reductionist and policy solutions will inevitably fail.

Jørgensen 12

(Ulrik, Department of Management Engineering, Innovation and Sustainability, Technical University of Denmark, Environment & Policy, “No Smooth, Managed Pathway to Sustainable Energy Systems – Politics, Materiality and Visions for Wind Turbine and Biogas Technology,” 2012, <http://www.springerlink.com/content/x170560383685725/fulltext.html//wyo-mm>)

The historical case …system transition.

#### The logic that pervades the elites ensures that policy efforts to combat climate change and help the environment have and will inevitably fail: politicians harbor that too many barriers exist, businessmen exclaim that policy would lead to loss of profit.

Crompton and Kasser 10

(Tom and Tim, Environment, “Human Identity: A Missing Link in Environmental Campaigning,” July-August 2010, <http://www.environmentmagazine.org/Archives/Back%20Issues/July-August%202010/human-identity-full.html///wyo-mm>)

Whatever the recent …interventions are needed.

#### Thus, Mary and I affirm that we should engage in a genealogical interrogation of our relationship to energy. While this is a potentially dangerous advocacy, the social injustices that would exist in lieu are far worse, and thus speaking out against the power structures in the face of danger represents an act of parrhesia that’s necessary to guide us towards truth of this topic.

Foucault 01

(Michael, transcribed from a series of recordings by Joseph Pearson, Fearless Speech, pgs 19-20//wyo-mm)

The last characteristic of … the Fifth Century A.D.

#### Parrhesia key and necessary to solve docility

Turner 11

(Robert, political theorist (Ph.D. Government, Cornell University, and medical researcher, currently doing epidemiological research at Sunnybrook Hospital in Toronto, Theory and Event, Volume 14, Issue 3, “Conditioned Subjects: Connolly, the Amygdala, Fear, and Freedom,” 2011, Project Muse/Wyo-MM)

All of our … this confrontation.

#### Our genealogical approach makes power visible, and resistance and political engagement possible

Mitchell **Dean**, Professor, Sociology, Macquarie University, GOVERNMENTALITY: POWER AND RULE IN MODERN SOCIETY, London: Sage, 19**99**, p. 44.

The ethico-political … loss.

#### Engaging in dissenting action is necessary to shock the political system that has come to favor the elites: micro-activism checks against hegemonic structures, and fragmentation is empirically proven to add depth to debate.

Drache 08

(Daniel, Associate Director of the Robarts Centre for Canadian Studies and Professor of Political Science at York University, Toronto, Defiant Publics, Chapter 4: “Nixers, Fixers, and the Axes of Conformity,” pgs 139-141//wyo-mm)

Compared to a decade ….. Who is listening? Everybody.

#### Debate is a key space of activism: sets the rules for how society functions.

Drache 08

(Daniel, Associate Director of the Robarts Centre for Canadian Studies and Professor of Political Science at York University, Toronto, Defiant Publics, Introduction, pg 14//wyo-mm)

Hannah Arendt …reasoning together.

#### Our project is not once and done: for successful activism dissent mustn’t plateau, but rather engage in a continuance of challenging the dominant frames that seek to control and regulate life.

Lovell 09

(Jarret S., Associate Professor of Politics, Administration, and Justice at California State University, Fullerton, Chapter 3: “Dissent as “Pure” Crime,” Crimes of Dissent, pg 102//wyo-mm)

If there is one … and repression.

#### This onto-epistemological criticism is a necessary prerequisite to any solution we imagine. The solutions are constrained by the ontological assumptions that precede their formation. Prioritizes certain forms of knowledge over others and results in serial policy failure.

Michael **Dillon**, Professor of Politics, University of Lancaster **and** Julian **Reid**, “Global Governance, Liberal Peace, and Complex Emergency,” ALTERNATIVES: SOCIAL TRANSFORMATION & HUMANE GOVERNANCE v. 25 n. 1, January/March 20**00**, npg.

As a precursor ….biopower" ways.